Improving Health Through Planning

Health Impact Assessments

Wednesday, Dec. 7, 2011
8:30 to 10 a.m.

MPC thanks Blue Cross Blue Shield of Illinois for supporting this event.
Towards Healthy & Equitable Public Policy

Presentation for the Chicago Metropolitan Planning Council

Rajiv Bhatia, MD, MPH
San Francisco Department of Public Health
What really makes us healthy (or not)?
Healthy public policy is an unrealized vision that requires collective action.

Fundamental conditions and resources for health:

- peace,
- shelter
- education
- food
- income
- a stable eco-system,
- sustainable resources
- social justice
Health costs and benefits of transportation

- Access to jobs, goods, services, social networks → not estimated
- Physical inactivity → 3.2 million deaths; 19 million healthy life years lost
- Traffic injuries → 1.3 million deaths
- Urban air pollution → 1.2 million deaths
- Traffic noise → stress, memory loss and cognitive impairment
SF Department of Public Health - Program on Health, Equity and Sustainability

- Engage with and support existing and emerging political agendas for social and environmental justice
- Work in multiple institutional sectors: Labor/employment; food; housing; planning; transportation
- Collaborate with every city governmental agency
- Conduct research and applied analysis to inform and advance policy agendas
- Develop and evaluate public health policies and laws
- Think globally / act locally
Community Health and Environmental Justice
Challenges to “Smart” Growth in San Francisco

- Will development protect and improve environmental quality for existing residents?
- Can development leverage needed infrastructure for health and well being?
- Will development result in displacement or facilitate social inclusion and integration?
- Will economic equity and health be included along with resource conservation in “sustainability?”
Health Impact Assessment

- A systematic process to judge the effect of societal decisions on health
- Uses a holistic definition of health—determinants, behaviors, diseases
- Considers multiple adverse and beneficial effects using multiple methods
- Strives for transparency
- Engages all stakeholders
- Identifies health promoting design alternatives
Developer proposed demolishing 360 rent-controlled apartments to build 1400 market rate condominiums

Planning: No adverse impacts on the population

Tenants: project would lead to stress, breaking social networks, budget strain, overcrowding

Health Department: Displacement = adverse health effects

City required 1:1 replacement or study of displacement impacts

Planning policy increased demolition protections for private housing
Healthy Development Measurement Tool

1) Community vision for a health city (27 objectives)
2) Community-level Health Indicators
3) Policy and Design Strategies
4) Criteria for healthy development
5) Public Health Evidence
Uses of health performance measure in the planning and transportation sector

- Indicators can **drive** institutional performance
  - Prioritize investments and interventions
  - Provide measures of accountability
- Indicators can leverage the investments and resource of the planning and transport sector to work for health
- Indicators can limit adverse health costs of transport investments and operations
- Measures of health and measures of equity are often missing from performance indicators and from initiatives to advance sustainability
Map of areas exceeding PM 2.5 standards:

Identifies high pollution areas for emissions and exposure reductions
Use of air and noise pollution exposure analysis to protect health in industrial to residential rezoning

- Rezoning of historically industrial lands threatened new environmental impacts on residents from noise, air pollutants, traffic hazards

- Air and noise pollution analysis justified new mitigations to reduce noise and air pollution exposure for new residents

- Provided basis for city law requiring improved ventilation for pollution impacted residential development
Map of High Corridor Injury Density:

Seven percent of city street miles account for 55% of serious and fatal pedestrian collisions.
Use of High-Injury Corridor Analyses to Pedestrian Safety Planning

- Reprioritized enforcement and engineering resources
  - Routine police presence along corridors
  - Engineering plans for high-injury corridors

- Identified gaps in existing safety toolkit
  - Arterial traffic calming
  - Photo-enforcement of speed
  - Turning restrictions

- Supports attention to policy obstacles
  - Limited Funding
  - Conflicts among the different transport modes
Map of quality elementary school access:

Illustrates challenge of providing public infrastructure for new growth
Health performance metrics now used for Bay Area Regional Planning

- GHG reduction
- Adequate housing
- Healthy and Safe Communities
  - PM 2.5 attributable mortality
  - Transportation Injuries
  - Active transportation time
- Open Space preservation
- Household transportation costs
- Reduction of Travel times
- Economic vitality—GDP growth
- Transportation system maintenance
Health Impact Assessment of Downtown Congestion Pricing

- **Decision:**
  - Proposed program to charge $3 during AM/PM rush hours to travel into or out of the congested northeast quadrant of San Francisco. Revenues would fund transport improvements.
  - Decision will be made by legislative body

- **Scope of Analysis:**
  - Active transportation & mortality
  - Particulate pollution & mortality
  - Traffic noise, stress and IHD
  - Pedestrian and cyclist injury
  - Equity in traffic density
  - Economic valuation
Are neighborhood food resources an important public health problem

- **Nutrition?**
  - Intervention studies suggest small effects of local access on diet
  - Access depends on proximity but also choice, cost, and transport.

- **Obesity?**
  - Increasing access or affordability may not decrease energy intake

- **Fairness?**
  - “Food deserts” are characteristics of infrastructure-poor segregated neighborhoods
Broader Lessons

- Societal institutions are failing to act in way that collectively creates conditions needed to fulfill human needs
- Health is a valued societal priority that could potential join many issues together as a shared collective agenda
- All work focused on environmental change is needs to engage broad stakeholders and constituencies to achieve multi-objective
- Public health can make contributions to a human needs agenda by
  - Monitoring the health consequences of political decisions;
  - Illustrating the multi-objective nature of policy
  - Developing and supporting accountability to health protective laws
Public health contributions to political conditions needed for health

- Public awareness of the determinants of health
- Monitoring system for health and health determinants
- Inter-institutional coordination and cooperation
- Health protective laws and regulations
- Organizational networks for advocacy and accountability
Resources:

SF HIA Collaborative
www.hiacollaborative.org

SF Department of Public Health
www.sfphes.org

Healthy Development Tool
www.thehdmt.org

UC Berkeley HIA Group
http://sites.google.com/site/ucbhia

Human Impact Partners
www.humanimpact.org
Improving Health Through Planning

Health Impact Assessments

Wednesday, Dec. 7, 2011
8:30 to 10 a.m.

MPC thanks Blue Cross Blue Shield of Illinois for supporting this event.
Health Impact Assessment

Examples from across the United States

Chicago Metropolitan Planning Council
December 7, 2011
We believe that health should be considered in all decision making.

We raise awareness of and collaboratively use innovative data, processes and tools that evaluate health impacts and inequities.

Through training and mentorship we also build the capacity of impacted communities and their advocates, workers, public agencies, and elected officials to conduct health-based analyses and use them to take action.
Incorporating Health into Decision-Making

The world would look different

- Development
- Farm Policy
- Incarceration
- Immigration
- Ports
- Education
Health Impact Assessment Purpose

Through HIA report and communications
Judge health effects of a proposed project, plan or policy
Highlight health disparities
Provide recommendations
Shape public decisions
Make health impacts more explicit

Through the HIA process
Impact discussion around the discussion to include health
Engage & empower community
Recognize lived experience
Build relationships & collaborations
Build consensus
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Steps of HIA</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Screening</td>
<td>Determines the need and value of a HIA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scoping</td>
<td>Determines which health impacts to evaluate, methods for analysis, and a workplan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment</td>
<td>Provides:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1) a profile of existing health conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2) evaluation of potential health impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>Provide strategies to manage identified adverse health impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reporting</td>
<td>Includes:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1) development of the HIA report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2) communication of findings &amp; recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring &amp; Evaluation</td>
<td>Tracks:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1) impacts on decision-making processes and the decision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2) impacts of the decision on health determinants</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Completed and In Progress HIAs 1999–2011: 113

Map Courtesy of A. Dannenberg, A. Wendel, CDC NCEH.

The Health Impact Project is a collaboration of the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation and The Pew Charitable Trusts.
HIA project examples

Transportation related HIAs

I-710 Expansion – Southern California
Road Pricing Policy – San Francisco, CA
Pittsburg Avenue Railroad Specific Plan – Pittsburg, CA
Lake Merritt BART Station Area Plan – Oakland, CA
Humboldt County General Plan Update - CA
Houston Light Rail Corridor Project - Texas
Light Rail Transit Line – St. Paul, Minnesota
McGrath Hwy Study (Mass Compact) – Somerville, MA
Food Policy Related HIAs

County Agricultural Plan – Hawaii
Farm-to-School policy – Oregon
Fast food zoning around schools – New Orleans, LA
Urban gardening zoning – Northampton, MA
Restaurant Menu Labeling – Los Angeles, CA
Urban Agricultural Overlay – Cleveland, OH

Proposed Food Policy Related HIAs

Competitive Foods in Schools standards – Oregon
Housing related HIAs

Trinity Plaza Specific Plan – San Francisco, CA
Federal Public Housing Revitalization bill – United States
Humboldt County General Plan Update - CA
San Francisco Public Housing Redevelopment – SF, CA
Jack London Gateway development – Oakland, CA
Los Angeles Redevelopment - CA
Focus for HIA: zoning & land use around CCLRL

Lead orgs: ISAIAH, Take Action Minnesota, PolicyLink

Screening:
- $1 billion transit investment; $7 billion in public and private investment in local development
- Highly diverse area in St. Paul/Minneapolis

Process – Community Steering Committee (22 constituency-based groups); Technical Advisory Panel, other stakeholder participation
FIGURE 1. CHANGES IN NEIGHBORHOOD LIVABILITY AND HEALTH

Changes in zoning and the built environment

Change in...

Environmental hazards (real and perceived)
Neighborhood infrastructure (libraries, parks)
Direct or indirect displacement
Local economy

Change in livability (real and perceived)

Neighborhood income distribution (more affluent residents move in)
Material and social support
Business investment
Property values

Change in...
Results

• **Assessment results** (Housing, Transit Access, Economy)
  - 49 indicators
  - Baseline & forecasting

• **Reporting** – church meetings; demonstrations; meetings with Planning Committee and City Council; engaged in official public planning process; media
  - Primary recommendations: targeted inclusionary zoning in “up market” areas; density bonuses; interim commercial parking on vacant land; first source hiring

• **Outcomes**
  - Built community power through whole process
  - Parking regulations; create Anti-Displacement Action Plan; studies re: smaller businesses & density
Farm-to-School/School Gardening Policy

- **Focus of HIA**: OR bill HB 2800 - state-wide bill to fund farm to school procurement & school gardens
- **Lead org**: Upstream Public Health
- **Critical partnerships**: OR Dept. of Education, OR Dept. of Agriculture, local processor, local distributor, school food service manager, Sodexo, farmers
- **Screening** – potential positive health impacts for vulnerable populations (children, low-income children); feasible to conduct HIA; results potentially useful in other areas; HIA would assess elusive impacts
- **Process**: 2 advisory committees – Practitioner Advisory Team, Technical Advisory Team, survey of F2S supporters, stakeholder interviews, community forums
How does the proposed policy affect health determinants and lead to health outcomes?

- Employment
- Diet and Nutrition
- F2SSG K-12 Education
- Environmental Health
- Social Capital
Results

- **Assessment results**
  - Job creation; children’s eating behaviors: chronic disease; school garden/education portion
- **Reporting** – legislative testimony; letters to & meetings with legislators/staff; media
  - Primary recs: modify eligible products to those ‘produced or processed in OR’; target grants to low-income, ethnically diverse, food insecure regions;

Outcomes

Bill passed!
Took two of three recommendations
Bill was modified to a pilot program (from $22.6 million to $2 million)
Weaving Health into Planning

HIA is one of many approaches to conducting incorporating health into planning processes.

Similarly, there are many ways for health to be woven into policy-making processes.
HIA Tools and Resources

http://www.humanimpact.org/component/jdownloads/finish/11/81

CA DPH/SFDPH Guidance on HIA: http://www.hiacollaborative.org/

Human Impact Partners HIA resources and projects
http://www.humanimpact.org/hips-hia-tools-and-resources
http://www.humanimpact.org/projects

San Francisco Department of Public Health: www.sfphes.org

SFDPH Healthy Development Measurement Tool: www.thehdmt.org

National Academies for the Sciences Guidance on HIA:
http://www.nap.edu/catalog.php?record_id=13229

Health Impact Project (Pew & RWJF): www.healthimpactproject.org
Improving Health Through Planning

Health Impact Assessments

Wednesday, Dec. 7, 2011
8:30 to 10 a.m.

MPC thanks Blue Cross Blue Shield of Illinois for supporting this event.
Health Impact Assessment in Chicago
prepared for
Health Through Planning
December 7, 2011

Lynn C. Todman, Ph.D.
Executive Director
Institute on Social Exclusion
Adler School of Professional Psychology
www.adler.edu
Mental Health Impact Assessment (MHIA)

- *Social Determinants of Mental Health: From Awareness to Action*. June 2010
- MHIA Pilot – Revision to the Chicago Vacant Buildings Ordinance (Municipal Code Chapter 13-12-125 *et seq.*) July – December 2010
Figure 1: Pathway diagram depicting the social determinants of mental health potentially impacted by the proposed amendment to the Vacant Buildings Ordinance.

Note: Decrease
Pilot MHIA: Pathways to Health
(Based on workshop feedback)

Note:
Based on feedback from the Health Impact Assessment (HIA) Workshop, hosted by the Adler School of Professional Psychology, September 28-29, 2010
Pilot MHIA: Pathways to Health

- January 2011 – Policy Brief submitted to sponsoring Alderman (Dowell – 3rd Ward)
- July 2011 – Todman testimony to a joint session of the Chicago City Council Housing & Real Estate and Housing & Zoning committees.
- July 2011 – City Council unanimous vote in favor (with commendation from the Major)
- November 2011 – Revised (lenders are no longer defined as “owners”) to avoid lawsuit
Comprehensive MHIA


- Timeline: January 2011 thru June 2012

- Partner Community: Englewood
Screening: March – June 2011

- Illinois Senate Bill 1284 in the 97th General Assembly. Amend the Illinois Human Right Act to clarify that employers may not inquire about or use criminal records of non-convictions in employment decisions.

Scoping: July – August 2011

- Research questions
- Key health determinants
- Mental health impacts of interest (mental well-being and mental illness)
  - Community processes
  - Individual processes
- Research plan (e.g., analytic methods, data sources),
- Participant roles and a timeline
Pathway Showing Impact On Mental Health When Arrest Records Are Used In Employment Decisions

PRINCIPAL RESEARCH QUESTION: What is the impact on the mental health of communities when employers use arrest records in making employment decisions about members of that community?
Assessment: September 2011 – February 2012

- Data collection (primary and secondary)
  - Surveys
  - Interviews
  - Focus groups
  - Systematic literature review
  - Meta-analysis
- Analysis
Recommendation, reporting, and evaluation/monitoring

- **Recommendations**: March 2011 – April 2012
- **Reporting**: March 2011 – June 2012
  - Developing frames and messages
  - Identifying message delivery formats/vehicles
- **Evaluation/Monitor**: March 2011 – July 2012
  - Independent evaluators
  - Retrospectives
  - Developing community capacity to monitor over the medium term (e.g., social network analysis).
MHIA and HIA

- EEOC Policy Guidance
- Employment Status
- Mental Health Outcomes
- Physical Health Outcomes
Mental Health Impact Assessment

Thank you

Ltodman@adler.edu
Improving Health Through Planning

Health Impact Assessments

Wednesday, Dec. 7, 2011
8:30 to 10 a.m.

MPC thanks Blue Cross Blue Shield of Illinois for supporting this event.
Improving Health Through Planning

Please complete our brief post-event survey (online – check your email inbox soon – on on paper in your packet).

Thank you!